The Ideologies of Education
In Search of the Pedagogical Sentiment
(In the spirit of Zvi Lamm)

Yoram Harpaz
www.yoramharpaz.com  yorhar@netvision.net.il
Three arguments

1. Educational "theories" are ideologies

2. There are three meta-ideologies in education

3. You must choose one of them
1. Educational "theories" are ideologies
The structure of ideology

Utopia

Diagnosis

Strategy

Collective
The structure of ideology

Utopia

An imagined picture of an ideal society
The structure of ideology

Diagnosis

A description and analysis of the actual society
The structure of ideology

The means to change the actual society into the ideal society
The structure of ideology

A social group that will carry out the change

Collective
Your turn

Choose an ideology and expose its structure
The Essence of Ideology

- The ideology fuses the four ingredients

- The fusion distorts the ingredients (e.g. diagnosis is biased by the utopia; strategy turns into a dogma)

- Since the ingredients are distorted (and the utopia has no rational and empirical basis) ideology is irrational
The Essentiality of Ideology

Ideologies are essential in three conditions:
The Essentiality of Ideology

Ideologies are essential in three conditions:

Need to do something, to act
The Essentiality of Ideology

Ideologies are essential in three conditions:

1. Need to do something, to act
2. More than one option
The Essentiality of Ideology

Ideologies are essential in three conditions:

- Need to do something, to act
- No rational/empirical way to choose between options
- More than one option
The Essentiality of Ideology

For example: Which party should I vote for? To which school should I enroll my child? And even – what should I wear? (Universal-structured ideologies/personal-diffused ideologies)
A Rational Attitude
to our Ideology

The Ideological Catch: ideology is irrational but essential

Out of the Catch: to be aware that my ideology is irrational and essential
Your turn

How is political ideology similar to pedagogical theory?

What is the meaning of this similarity?
# Political and Educational Ideologies have the same Structure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ideologies</th>
<th>Political Ideology</th>
<th>Pedagogical Ideology</th>
<th>Ideology of teaching thinking</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ingredients</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Utopia</strong></td>
<td>Image of the ideal society</td>
<td>Image of the ideal graduate, “The Educated Man”</td>
<td>Image of The Good Thinker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Diagnosis</strong></td>
<td>Description of the actual society</td>
<td>Description of the actual students</td>
<td>Description of the actual thinkers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Strategy</strong></td>
<td>Means to turn the actual society into the ideal society</td>
<td>The pattern of teaching, the method of assessing, etc.</td>
<td>The pattern of teaching, the method of assessing, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Collective</strong></td>
<td>The social group that will make the change</td>
<td>The educational community</td>
<td>The educational community</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
There are three meta-ideologies in education
The Three Meta-Ideologies of Education

Education serves three masters

Socialization
Adapting the child to society; imparting useful behaviors

Acculturation
Shaping the child's character in light of the values of the preferred culture

Individuation
Fostering the autonomy and the authenticity of the child
The Formula of Teaching

\[ t + i + c + s = p \]

teacher + instruction + content + student = purpose

The purpose = the desired graduate

The desired graduate = knowledge, skills, traits, worldview
L. S. Lowry, Industrial landscapes, 1943
P1 = Socialization

**Teacher:** classroom manager; imparts facts and skills

**Instruction:** autocratic; exemplifying and exercising

**Content:** practical and useful

**Student:** all students are the same; learning by imitation

**Purpose:** The Educated Person is adapted to his/her society
\[ P_2 = \text{Acculturation} \]

**Teacher:** a live model of the demanded values and truth

**Instruction:** authoritative; modelling

**Content:** inner value

**Student:** different (should be same); learning by internalization

**Purpose:** The Educated Person is one whose character reflects cultural values and truth
Jan Steen, A school for boys and girls, 1617
P3 = Individuation

Teacher: a facilitator

Instruction: a guidance sensitive to individual needs

Content: supports individual development

Student: each student is unique; self-regulated learning

Purpose: The Educated Person is one who fulfills himself/herself
3.

You must choose one of them
The “Tragic” Choice

The tempting conclusion:
let’s teach for socialization, acculturation and individuation

The sad truth:
there is a contradiction between the educational means of the meta-ideologies

Therefore:
we must stick to one ideology
How we choose a pedagogical ideology

- According to our pedagogical sentiment
- According to the context
The ideological choice

The pedagogical sentiments

**Socialization:** Practical pedagogical sentiment

**Acculturation:** Intellectual, ethical and esthetic pedagogical sentiment

**Individuation:** Humane pedagogical sentiment
The contextual choice

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Socialization:</th>
<th>Acculturation:</th>
<th>Individuation:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Non-normative youth</td>
<td>Normative youth</td>
<td>Advanced youth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heteronomy</td>
<td>Internelized heteronomy</td>
<td>Autonomy</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The challenge of the post-modern world

Socialization: The end of work
Acculturation: The end of culture
Individuation: The end of the individual

But still: the pedagogical ideologies are valid
In conclusion:

The moment of truth

1. To which ideology am I attracted?
2. Which ideology dominates N.Z Schools? and my school?
3. Which ideology should dominate N.Z schools? and my school?