

The Ideologies of Education

In Search of the Pedagogical Sentiment

(In the spirit of Zvi Lamm)

Yoram Harpaz

www.yoramharpaz.com yorhar@netvision.net.il

Three arguments

1. Educational "theories" are ideologies
2. There are three meta-ideologies in education
3. You must choose one of them

1.

Educational "theories" are ideologies

The structure of ideology

Utopia

Diagnosis

Strategy

Collective

The structure of ideology



Utopia

An imagined
picture of an
ideal society

The structure of ideology



Diagnosis

A description
and analysis
of the actual
society

The structure of ideology



The means
to change the
actual society
into the ideal
society

The structure of ideology



Collective

A social
group that
will carry out
the change

Your turn

**Choose an ideology
and expose its
structure**

The Essence of Ideology

- ⊙ **The ideology fuses the four ingredients**
- ⊙ **The fusion distorts the ingredients**
(e.g. diagnosis is biased by the utopia; strategy turns into a dogma)
- ⊙ **Since the ingredients are distorted**
(and the utopia has no rational and empirical basis) **ideology is irrational**


The Essentiality of Ideology

Ideologies are essential in three conditions:



The Essentiality of Ideology

Ideologies are essential in three conditions:



Need to do
something,
to act

The Essentiality of Ideology

Ideologies are essential in three conditions:

Need to do
something,
to act

More than
one option

The Essentiality of Ideology

Ideologies are essential in three conditions:

Need to do something,
to act

More than
one option

No rational/
empirical way to
choose between
options

The Essentiality of Ideology

For example: Which party should I vote for? To which school should I enroll my child? And even – what should I wear? (Universal-structured ideologies/personal-diffused ideologies)

A Rational Attitude to our Ideology

**The Ideological
Catch:** ideology
is irrational but
essential

**Out of the
Catch: to be aware**
that my ideology
is irrational and
essential

Your turn

How is political ideology similar to pedagogical theory?
What is the meaning of this similarity?

Political and Educational Ideologies have the same Structure

Ideologies Ingredients	Political Ideology	Pedagogical Ideology	Ideology of teaching thinking
Utopia	Image of the ideal society	Image of the ideal graduate, "The Educated Man"	Image of The Good Thinker
Diagnosis	Description of the actual society	Description of the actual students	Description of the actual thinkers
Strategy	Means to turn the actual society into the ideal society	The pattern of teaching, the method of assessing, etc.	The pattern of teaching, the method of assessing, etc.
Collective	The social group that will make the change	The educational community	The educational community

2.

There are three meta-ideologies in education

The Three Meta-Ideologies of Education

Education serves three masters

Socialization

Adapting the child to society; imparting useful behaviors

Acculturation

Shaping the child's character in light of the values of the preferred culture

Individuation

Fostering the autonomy and the authenticity of the child

The Formula of Teaching

$$t + i + c + s = p$$

teacher + instruction + content + student = purpose

The purpose = the desired graduate

The desired graduate = knowledge, skills, traits, worldview



L. S. Lowry, Industrial landscapes, 1943

P1 = Socialization



Teacher: classroom manager;
imparts facts and skills

+

Instruction: autocratic; exemplifying and exercising

+

Content: practical and useful

+

Student: all students are the same;
learning by imitation

=

Purpose: The Educated Person is
adapted to his/her society



Raphael, The School of Athens, 1510

P₂ = Acculturation



Teacher: a live model of the demanded values and truth

+

Instruction: authoritative; modelling

+

Content: inner value

+

Student: different (should be same); learning by internalization

=

Purpose: The Educated Person is one whose character reflects cultural values and truth



Jan Steen, A school for boys and girls, 1617

P₃ = Individuation

Teacher: a facilitator

+

Instruction: a guidance sensitive to individual needs

+

Content: supports individual development

+

Student: each student is unique; self-regulated learning

=

Purpose: The Educated Person is one who fulfills himself/herself



3.

**You must choose
one of them**

The “Tragic” Choice

The tempting conclusion:

let's teach for socialization, acculturation and individuation

The sad truth:

there is a contradiction between the educational means of the meta-ideologies

Therefore:
we must stick to one ideology

How we choose a pedagogical ideology

- ⦿ According to our pedagogical sentiment
- ⦿ According to the context

The ideological choice

The pedagogical sentiments

Socialization:

Practical
pedagogical
sentiment

Acculturation:

Intellectual,
ethical and
esthetic
pedagogical
sentiment

Individuation:

Humane
pedagogical
sentiment

The contextual choice

Socialization:

**Non-normative
youth**

Heteronomy

Acculturation:

**Normative
youth**

Internalized
heteronomy

Individuation:

**Advanced
youth**

Autonomy

The challenge of the post-modern world

Socialization:

The end
of work

Acculturation:

The end of
culture

Individuation:

The end of the
individual

But still: the pedagogical ideologies are valid

In conclusion:

The moment of truth

1.

To which ideology am I attracted?
What is my pedagogical sentiment?

2.

Which ideology dominates N.Z Schools? and my school?

3.

Which ideology should dominate N.Z schools? and my school?

Yoram Harpaz

Teaching and Learning in a Community of Thinking

The Third Model

 Springer